

## BOARD OF HIGHER EDUCATION

---

February 14, 2023

10:00 a.m.

Livestreamed, via Zoom

### Meeting Minutes

A meeting of the Board of Higher Education (“BHE” or “the Board”) was held virtually on Tuesday, February 14, 2023 on the web-conference platform Zoom.

#### **The following Board Members were present:**

Chris Gabrieli, Chair

Mary Burns<sup>1</sup>

Ann Christensen

Veronica Conforme

Alex Cortez

Patty Eppinger

Travis Lawrence

Paul Mattera

Judy Pagliuca<sup>2</sup>

Paul Toner

Pat Tutwiler, Secretary of Education

Bill Walczak

Andrew Whitcomb, non-voting Student Advisor, UMass segment

Robert Huttig, non-voting Student Advisor, State University segment

Noe Ortega, Commissioner and Secretary to the Board

#### **The following Board Members were absent:**

None

### **I. CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Chris Gabrieli called the meeting to order at 10:05 a.m. and announced that this meeting is being held remotely and in accordance with relevant amendments to the Open Meeting Law. Chair Gabrieli announced that the meeting is being livestreamed via Zoom and recorded, and members of the public who signed up for public comment would be allowed to join the Zoom meeting to provide comment. Department of Higher Education (DHE or Department) Chief of Staff Elena Quiroz-Livanis took roll call attendance (see above for attendance roster).

---

<sup>1</sup> Left the meeting at 11:15 am

<sup>2</sup> Arrived at 11:10 am

## II. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Chair Gabrieli reported that there was one request for public participation from the Massachusetts Teachers Association President, Max Page ("Dr. Page"). He was allotted three minutes to speak.

Dr. Page provided commentary on the Cherish Act and the Tomorrow's Educators Program. He discussed the Cherish Act would guarantee debt-free public higher education at community colleges and four-year universities. Dr. Page stated that the Cherish Act considers the true cost of attendance and would expand the DHE's Student Assistance & Success Programs. It would also assure equitable and competitive pay for adjunct academics and other faculty and staff to attract bright applicants and support green and healthy college and university building updates. Dr. Page endorsed the Tomorrow's Educators Program's \$15 million budget. He requested that community college students be included in the program, explaining that at a time when there is a need for pathways to help community college students become educators, we must give them access to all available programs and try to resolve any obstacles that prevent us from supporting our students. Dr. Page closed by urging BHE support for the Cherish Act.

## III. WELCOME

Board Chair Gabrieli welcomed Dr. Patrick Tutwiler, the Commonwealth's newly appointed Secretary of Education, to his first BHE meeting. Chair Gabrieli stated that today's meeting would cover the Tomorrow's Teachers Scholarship Program, would include a vote on the funding formulas for community colleges and state universities, and would also include a budget vote, followed by an update on our Performance Measurement Reporting System from Associate Commissioner Mario Delci.

Chair Gabrieli welcomed former DHE Commissioner Dr. Carlos Santiago ("Dr. Santiago") to the meeting, stating that the Board wished to recognize the former commissioner in honor of his formal retirement, effective December 1, 2022. He acknowledged Dr. Santiago's agreement to continue as a consultant and advisor to his predecessor, Commissioner Noe Ortega, for two months during the transition and thanked him for his service, which has concluded. Chair Gabrieli read a resolution which enumerated several of Dr. Santiago's accomplishments as follows:

WHEREAS, the Massachusetts Board of Higher Education recognizes the significant accomplishments of Dr. Carlos E. Santiago at the conclusion of his tenure as Commissioner of Higher Education, after over forty years of service to the education profession; and

WHEREAS, Commissioner Santiago holds a Bachelor of Arts degree from the University of Miami, and a Master of Arts from the University of Puerto Rico, and a Master of Arts and a Doctorate from Cornell University; and

WHEREAS, prior to serving as the Commissioner of Higher Education, Dr. Santiago served as the Department of Higher Education's Senior Deputy Commissioner for Academic Affairs for two years, and prior to that was the Chief Executive Officer for the Hispanic College Fund, and

the Chancellor of the University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee for six years, and also held several appoints at the University at Albany, State University of New York, including Provost and Vice President for Academic Affairs and Full Professor in the Department of Latin American & Caribbean Studies and Department of Economics; and

WHEREAS, Dr. Santiago is a world-renowned scholar in the field of economics, with an emphasis in labor economics, and has authored or co-authored six books and has published dozens of articles and book reviews, many of which focus on economic development and the changing socioeconomic status of Latinos in the United States;

WHEREAS, Dr. Santiago has been nationally recognized for his contributions to higher education and received the Alfredo de Los Santos Jr. Distinguished Leadership Award in 2022 from the American Association of Hispanics in Higher Education, and has been named one of the 100 Most Influential Hispanics in the United States on two separate occasions; and

WHEREAS, Dr. Santiago has served on numerous boards, including the Advisory Committee of the Smithsonian Museum of African American Culture and History, the Board of Directors of the Council for Higher Education Accreditation, the Board of Directors of *Excelencia* in Education, and on the Advisory Council for the Marie Fielder Center for Democracy, Leadership, and Education; and

WHEREAS, under Dr. Santiago's leadership, the Department of Higher Education was the recipient of the 2021 State Higher Education Executive Officer Exceptional Agency Award; and WHEREAS, while Commissioner of Higher Education, Dr. Santiago was a key architect of the Equity Agenda and has actively worked to transform higher education, both in the Commonwealth and across the country, and his efforts have improved the lives of thousands of students and families; and

WHEREAS, Dr. Santiago has worked tirelessly throughout his tenure and has demonstrated profound commitment to what is best for students of the Commonwealth and its institutions of higher education.

Now, therefore, be it resolved that: On behalf of the members of the Board of Higher Education, the Department staff, and the students and institutions of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, the Massachusetts Board of Higher Education honors and commends Dr. Carlos E. Santiago for an extraordinary tenure as Commissioner of Higher Education.

Chair Gabrieli stated that in recognition of these, and many other accomplishments, and in recognition of his retirement, Commissioner Santiago has asked, and we have agreed to offer him the honorary title of "*Commissioner Emeritus*" -- an honorific title which carries with it no rights, benefits or responsibilities. He noted that while the BHE does not have a protocol for this, consistent with how these matters are handled at a campus level, he asked for a Board vote to grant this honorific title. With that Chair Gabrieli moved to confer upon Dr. Carlos E. Santiago the title of "*Commissioner Emeritus*."

**MOVED:** the Board of Higher Education hereby confers upon Dr. Carlos E. Santiago the honorary title of "Commissioner Emeritus." On a motion duly made and seconded, the floor motion was approved unanimously by all Board members present, through roll call vote, as follows:

- Mary Burns – Yes
- Ann Christensen – Yes
- Veronica Conforme – Yes
- Alex Cortez – Yes
- Patty Eppinger – Yes
- Chair Chris Gabrieli – Yes
- Paul Mattera – Yes
- Paul Toner – Yes
- Patrick Tutwiler, Secretary of Education – Yes
- Bill Walczak – Yes

Dr. Santiago thanked the Board. He expressed his gratitude for the *Emeritus* designation which typically recognizes professional longevity and significant contributions to an institution's mission. He recognized his 43 years of combined service in higher education and thanked the Board for upholding the mission, beliefs, and traditions of our public institutions.

Chair Gabrieli concluded the discussion by thanking Dr. Santiago for his contributions and wishing him well in his future endeavors.

#### **IV. REMARKS & REPORTS**

##### **A. Chair's Remarks**

Chair Gabrieli thanked Secretary Tutwiler for his leadership and advocacy on behalf of Early College. After discussing with Commissioner Ortega how the Board can collaborate on the next quarter's agenda, Chair Gabrieli reported that they agreed to focus their efforts on organizing a Board retreat in late spring or early summer 2023, which will give Secretary Tutwiler time to adjust to his new position and Commissioner Ortega time to plan his strategy. The retreat will center on the BHE's annual meeting, which will include a discussion of Board functions, the effectiveness of advisory council structures, whether or not all board members agree that decisions made since the end of the pandemic are working, and whether adjustments are necessary.

##### **B. Commissioner's Remarks**

Commissioner Ortega began by congratulating Secretary Tutwiler on his appointment and presence at his first BHE meeting. He then discussed his experiences as the Massachusetts Commissioner of Higher Education over the previous four months. After visiting campuses and meeting with presidents, administrators, staff faculty, industry leaders, and elected officials who came out to support them, Commissioner Ortega stated that the conversation kept returning to

how post-secondary education in the Commonwealth is a major contributor to economic development, recovery, and social mobility for our residents.

Commissioner Ortega stated he had the opportunity to attend a Student Advisory Council (SAC) meeting. The students proposed during their meeting that financial investments in higher education be redirected to scholarships and investing in institutions to ensure that college is affordable and that they have the necessary services to secure food, living expenses, health care, and other essentials to increase student success. According to the Commissioner, students asked the BHE to consider opportunities that will empower students to work collaboratively with faculty and institutions to co-create efforts that benefit the students.

Commissioner Ortega emphasized the importance of working together as a system to create more opportunities for our students and ways to improve our limited resources to meet their needs. The Commissioner tied this to the topic of innovation, and he used the example of NFL quarterback and Super Bowl winner Patrick Mahomes, a first-generation student who also participated in an Early College program while in high school. The Commissioner stated that such innovation programs pave the way for opportunities for our students which is why the work is so critical. He committed to continuing these discussions at future Board meetings and the upcoming Board retreat to ensure we find ways to align our institutions to better serve students' needs.

#### **C. Secretary of the Executive Office of Education's (EOE) Remarks**

Secretary Tutwiler thanked the Board for welcoming him and gave an overview of his educational background as well as his "why" in advocating for changes to higher education policies. Secretary Tutwiler stated that his why is encapsulated in a moral imperative that includes education as the primary driver of equity of opportunity, equity of experience, and equity of access. He stated that it has been the foundation of his professional leadership experience for the past 22 years and that it continues to motivate him to ensure that students can thrive in a pathway to realize their dreams. The Secretary concluded his remarks by expressing his eagerness to work with the BHE to move along initiatives worthy of the Massachusetts learning community forward. He then returned the meeting to Chair Gabrieli for the next item on the agenda.

#### **D. Report from Presidents**

##### State University Segmental Report

##### [President John Keenan's Remarks](#)

Salem State University President John Keenan ("President Keenan") provided an update on the Massachusetts State University System on behalf of the State University Council of Presidents. He expressed their eagerness to work with the new DHE and EOE leadership teams and their commitment to working hard to create an accessible pathway for all students, particularly those in gateway communities.

President Keenan then endorsed the FY24 Budget Proposal, stating that the expected \$1.3 billion in additional tax revenues since the passage of the "Fair Share" amendment would provide resources for investment in our higher education institutions, ensuring that we can continue to provide access to high-quality, affordable public colleges and universities. He requested that the BHE approve the FY24 budget but first provided an overview of the budget's recommended investments, which include:

- Investing in our students through direct financial aid;
- Investing in our institutional operating costs by establishing a base appropriation that recognizes costs associated with our labor contracts and funding formula allocations from FY23 appropriations;
- A 3% allocation to the State Universities' performance-based Funding Formula line item;
- Investment in student success by creating a separate appropriation to fund student supports for socio-economically disadvantaged students based on a \$2,000-per-Pell-eligible-student appropriation;

Increased funding for the SUCCESS program; and Expansion of early college initiatives.

President Keenan spoke about the constraints of underfunded State University projects due to the "cost-sharing" model of financing public higher education capital construction at a cap of \$30 million, which is no longer sustainable due to inflation. He requested that the BHE reconsider the policy to prevent state construction costs from being passed on to students. President Keenan concluded his remarks by sharing the State University's Council of Presidents' continued advocacy for students in their support of All Advocacy Day, scheduled to convene at the State House on February 28, 2023 to advocate for reinvestment in public higher education.

### Community College Segmental Report

#### [President David Podell's Remarks](#)

Mass Bay Community College President David Podell ("President Podell") welcomed Secretary Tutwiler and offered comment on the day's agenda, noting that while the funding formula allocations are acceptable for now, they will soon need to be revisited. He endorsed the FY24 budget recommendations, highlighting the Community College Council of Presidents' support for the SUCCESS line-item increase, the MassReconnect initiative, and three budget elements that would have a substantial impact on community colleges, including:

- funding for students' living expenses;
- support for collective bargaining costs; and
- an increase in Dual Enrollment and Early College funding.

President Podell discussed the ongoing support of the Education and Training Fund by the Council of Community College Presidents. The fund enables community colleges to offer no-cost, high-demand workforce training programs consistent with regional labor market blueprints. President Podell concluded his remarks by mentioning the Council of Community College Presidents' unwavering support for enumeration as a method of calculating enrollment, taaccounting for students whose financial and personal circumstances compel them to enroll part-time. agenda's .

Chair Gabrieli welcomed Student Member Lawrence to share remarks on behalf of the Student

Advisory Council (SAC).

#### **E. Report from Student Advisory Council**

Student Member Lawrence, Chair of the Student Advisory Council (SAC) provided an overview of his team's recent Community Building Day and Legislative Advocacy Plan initiatives. The Community Building Day will be held on **April 5, 2023, from 12 p.m. to 2 p.m.**, and will emphasize advocacy for student basic security needs. During that week, the State University and Community College campuses are also asked to host an event that supports and raises awareness for basic needs. Member Lawrence asked State University Student Segmental Advisor Robert Huttig to discuss the Legislative Advocacy Plan.

Mr. Huttig stated that Basic Needs Security has been a topic of discussion at SAC meetings, and that they would like to push for legislative recognition, especially when students exceed the qualification threshold and appear ineligible for more generous subsidies. Mr. Huttig continued to talk about the Hunger Free Campus program, which helps students at two and four-year public colleges who are food insecure. He expressed concern that institutions unable to quantify their needs will not be adequately funded. Mr. Huttig then delegated leadership of the discussion on SAC's advocacy on Ballot Question No. 1, the "Millionaires Tax," to the University of Massachusetts Segmental Student Advisor Whitcomb.

Mr. Whitcomb invited the BHE to attend the March 23, 2023, SAC meeting to learn more about their initiatives. He stated that SAC is made up of student trustees and student government presidents from every university in the state, who, along with students, are excited to get to know BHE members better. University of Massachusetts (U)On behalf of students within the University of Massachusetts (UMass) segment, Mr. Whitcomb endorsed the "Millionaires Tax" legislation. He stated that students would appreciate any assistance provided by the state for less fortunate and first-generation students. Student government leaders and student trustees from across UMass will send a letter to Commissioner Ortega and Governor Healey in the coming weeks to express their support for these initiatives. Mr. Whitcomb concluded his remarks by stating how crucial it is that Massachusetts recognizes the importance of reinvesting in public higher education for the good of all students. Such an Chair Gabrieli shared his appreciation for the perspectives the Student Advisory Council members bring to emphasize how policies translate to students. He then invited Academic Affairs and Student Success Advisory (AA&SS) Council Chair Patty Eppinger to share remarks.

### **V. ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORTS**

#### **A. Academic Affairs and Student Success**

AA&SS Co-Chair Eppinger reported that her group heard presentations on STEM-Starter Academy and the Teacher Education Program. The STEM-Starter Academy presentation, according to AA&SS Chair Eppinger, reported on the eighth year's results, in which 9,500 of the 31,000 students served earned degrees or certificates, and 2,700 transferred to four-year colleges. The STEM-Starter Academy program, now in its tenth year, is offered at each of the Commonwealth's 15 Community Colleges. Because the program has been so successful, the AA&SS Advisory Council hopes to apply what it has

learned to other initiatives.

**According to AA&SS-Chair Eppinger, to diversify our teacher population, we must increase the population through various programs that provide funding options for future teachers. Scholarships, grants, forgivable loans, and tuition waivers are examples of such programs designed to meet workforce demands and diversify our teacher pool. AA&SSCo-Chair Eppinger then outlined the initiatives in place to promote a more diverse teaching workforce. She also stated that the group discussed outreach programs and ways to ensure that students in our higher education system are aware of the available resources. her agenda's.**

## **VI. EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT & MOTIONS**

List of Documents Used

[BHE 23-24](#)

[BHE 23-25](#)

[BHE 23-27](#)

[BHE 23-28](#)

[BHE 23-29](#)

[BHE 23-30](#)

Chair Gabrieli introduced the first motion on the agenda, *BHE 23-24 Approval of Letter of Intent to Massachusetts College of Liberal Arts (MCLA) to Award the Bachelor of Science in Nursing and Authorization for Fast Track Review*. He invited Commissioner Ortega to offer comments.

Commissioner Ortega stated that he appreciated the willingness of reported MCLA hf President Jamie Birge and Berkshire Community College President Ellen Kennedy's willingness to connect with the Department. Both are working to form better collaborations with each other to ensure they are creating pathways for students as they put the BSN program together. Commissioner Ortega confirmed that the proposal met the BHE Letter of Intent (LOI) checklist of requirements, including meeting a need shared throughout the Commonwealth. He then returned the meeting to Chair Gabrieli to continue the discussion.

Chair Gabrieli stated the Executive Committee decided not to vote on the proposal last week, but rather decided to advance the proposal to the full board without a recommendation; the intended purpose was to allow Commissioner Ortega to advance the collaboration discussions between MCLA and Berkshire Community College. Chair Gabrieli opened the meeting for questions.

Member Walczak expressed gratitude to Chair Gabrieli and Commissioner Ortega for responding to his concerns at the Executive Committee meeting. He stressed the importance of having nurses with a Bachelor's degree and the importance of collaboration between Community Colleges and State Universities in terms of how programs are added. Member Walczak stated that the need for "systemness," as expressed by Commissioner Ortega, is a guiding principle for the Strategic Planning Committee to ensure that this occurs. He then returned the meeting to Chair Gabrieli to continue the discussion.



Chair Gabrieli opened the meeting for questions. There being none, he asked for a roll call vote. On a motion duly made and seconded, BHE 23-24 was approved, through roll call vote, as follows:

- Mary Burns – (Not present)
- Ann Christenson – Yes
- Veronica Conforme – Yes
- Alex Cortez – Yes
- Patty Eppinger – Yes
- Chair Chris Gabrieli – Yes
- Travis Lawrence – Yes
- Paul Mattera – Yes
- Judy Pagliuca – Yes
- Paul Toner – Yes
- Patrick Tutwiler, Secretary of Education – Yes
- Bill Walczak – Yes

---

Chair Gabrieli turned to the next motion on the agenda, *BHE 23-25 Approval of Letter of Intent of Westfield State University to Award the Bachelor of Fine Arts in Graphic Design and Authorization for Fast Track Review*. Hearing no discussion he called for a vote. On a motion duly made and seconded, BHE 23-25 was approved, through roll call vote, as follows:

- Ann Christenson – Yes

- Veronica Conforme – Yes
- Alex Cortez – Yes
- Patty Eppinger – Yes
- Chair Chris Gabrieli – Yes
- Travis Lawrence – Yes
- Paul Mattera – Yes
- Judy Pagliuca – Yes
- Paul Toner – Yes
- Patrick Tutwiler, Secretary of Education – Yes
- Bill Walczak – Yes

**BHE 23-25            APPROVAL OF LETTER OF INTENT OF WESTFIELD STATE UNIVERSITY TO AWARD THE BACHELOR OF FINE ARTS IN GRAPHIC DESIGN AND AUTHORIZATION FOR FAST TRACK REVIEW**

**VOTED:**            The Board of Higher Education (BHE) has evaluated the Letter of Intent of Westfield State University to award the Bachelor of Fine Arts in Graphic Design and has determined that the proposal aligns with BHE criteria. Accordingly, the BHE authorizes the Commissioner to review the program and to make a final determination on degree granting authority pursuant to the Fast-Track review protocol.

Authority            Massachusetts General Laws Chapter 15A, Section 9(b); AAC 18-40

Contact:            Winifred M. Hagan, Ed.D., Senior Associate Commissioner for Strategic Planning and Public Program Approval

Chair Gabrieli introduced the next motion, *BHE 23-27 Revocation of the Degree Granting Authority of Pine Manor College*. Hearing no discussion he called for a vote. On a motion duly made and seconded, BHE 23-27 was approved, through roll call vote, as follows:

- Ann Christenson – Yes
- Veronica Conforme – Yes
- Alex Cortez – Yes
- Patty Eppinger – Yes
- Chair Chris Gabrieli – Yes
- Travis Lawrence – Yes
- Paul Mattera – Yes
- Judy Pagliuca – Yes
- Paul Toner – Yes
- Patrick Tutwiler, Secretary of Education – Yes
- Bill Walczak – Yes

**BHE 23-27            REVOCATION OF THE DEGREE GRANTING AUTHORITY OF PINE MANOR COLLEGE**

**VOTED:**            The Board of Higher Education hereby revokes the legal authority of Pine Manor College to operate and grant degrees in the Commonwealth of Massachusetts retroactive to December 31, 2022.

Authority            Massachusetts General Laws Chapter 69, Section 30 et seq.; 610 CMR 2 and 13.

Contact:            Cynthia Farr Brown, Ph.D., Associate Commissioner of Regulatory and Veterans Affairs

Chair Gabrieli introduced the next item on the agenda, *BHE 23-28 Approval of Guidelines for the Tomorrow's Teacher Scholarship Program*. He invited Commissioner Ortega to offer comments.

Commissioner Ortega discussed the Future Teacher Scholarship Program. He thanked the Department's Senior Deputy Commissioner for Access and Student Financial Assistance and Interim Chief Academic Officer, Dr. Clantha McCurdy, and her team for their efforts in developing the program's guidelines, and he highlighted some of its most notable features. According to Commissioner Ortega, the initiative is motivated by a teacher shortage. He stated that one of the most important aspects of our postsecondary education strategy is ensuring that students have access to educators who can provide them with the knowledge and skills they need to succeed, particularly as they transition from elementary school to choosing a postsecondary education path. Although additional funding is required to significantly impact the educator workforce, Commissioner Ortega emphasized that this is only the first step in recruiting pipeline candidates. The overarching goal of these guiding principles is to find ways to make this path more accessible and affordable to individuals and facilitate their successful completion. The Tomorrow's Teacher Scholarship Program is for full-time students who are enrolled in a Bachelor's degree or Post-Baccalaureate educator program at a public college or university, and who have also committed to teaching for four years in a public school after graduation. If the student fails to fulfill the four-year teaching obligation, the scholarship benefits convert to a loan that must be repaid. As a result, students who enroll in this program must be well on their way to completion and success. Anything less would be counterproductive. Commissioner Ortega stated that the BHE would continue to advocate for additional funding and evaluate the recommendations' effectiveness regularly to determine whether further changes are required. He then returned the meeting to Chair Gabrieli to continue the discussion.

Chair Gabrieli opened the floor to questions. There being none, he turned to Department Chief of Staff Elena Quiroz-Livanis to begin the roll call.

On a motion duly made and seconded, BHE 23-28 was approved, through roll call vote, as follows:

- Ann Christenson – Yes
- Veronica Conforme – Yes
- Alex Cortez – Yes
- Patty Eppinger – Yes
- Chair Chris Gabrieli – Yes
- Travis Lawrence – Yes
- Paul Mattera – Yes
- Judy Pagliuca – Yes
- Paul Toner – Yes
- Patrick Tutwiler, Secretary of Education – Yes
- Bill Walczak – Yes

**BHE 23-28                    APPROVAL OF GUIDELINES FOR THE TOMORROW’S TEACHERS SCHOLARSHIP PROGRAM**

**VOTED**                    The Board of Higher Education hereby adopts the attached Guidelines for the Tomorrow’s Teachers Scholarship Program.

Authority                    M.G.L. c. 15A, § 19D as established by Ch. 126 Mass. Acts 2022, § 10; and Ch. 126 Mass. Acts 2022, § 2 (Line Item 7061-9805).

Contact:                    Clantha McCurdy, Ph.D., Senior Deputy Commissioner for Access & Student Financial Assistance and Interim CAO

Chair Gabrieli introduced the next motion *BHE 23-29 Approval of the Community College and State University Funding Formula Allocation for FY23*. He stated that the motion seeks approval of the Community College and State University funding formula allocations for FY23. Chair Gabrieli suggested that this would be a good topic for the Fiscal Affairs and Administrative Policy (FAAP) Advisory Council and staff to take up for next fiscal year, to assess the formula and determine if it is still the best one to use. Veronica Conforme, the FAAP Co-Chair, agreed with Chair Gabrieli's suggestion that FAAP reevaluate funding formula allocations. He turned to Chief of Staff Elena Quiroz-Livanis to begin the roll call after hearing no further comments from the Board.

On a motion duly made and seconded, BHE 23-29 was approved, through roll call vote, as follows:

- Ann Christenson – Yes
- Veronica Conforme – Yes
- Alex Cortez – Yes
- Patty Eppinger – Yes
- Chair Chris Gabrieli – Yes
- Travis Lawrence – Yes
- Paul Mattera – Yes

- Judy Pagliuca – Yes
- Paul Toner – Yes
- Patrick Tutwiler, Secretary of Education – Yes
- Bill Walczak – Yes

**BHE 23-29                    APPROVAL OF THE COMMUNITY COLLEGE AND STATE UNIVERSITY FUNDING FORMULA ALLOCATIONS FOR FY2023**

**VOTED**                    The Board of Higher Education hereby approves the Community College and State University funding formula allocations for FY2023 (Attachments [A](#) and [B](#)).

Authority                    M.G.L. c. 15A, § 9(dd); M.G.L. c. 15A, §15B; Line item 7066-1400 of section 2 of Chapter 165 of the Acts of 2014; Line items 7066-1400 and 7100- 4000. Section 2 of Chapter 126 of the Acts of 2022.

Contact:                    Joe Wallerstein, Interim Deputy Commissioner for Administration and Finance

**VII. BOARD OF HIGHER EDUCATION**

List of Documents Used  
[BHE 23-30](#)

Chair Gabrieli introduced the final motion on the agenda, *BHE 23-30 Approval of the Board of Higher Education FY24 Budget Recommendations*. He stated that the recommendations circulated as a memorandum in the board packet are consistent with *BHE 23-23, the Strategic Review of Public Higher Education Financing: Endorsement of a Policy Framework* adopted by the BHE in December 2022. Chair Gabrieli invited Commissioner Ortega to offer comments.

Commissioner Ortega stated that the memo represents the DHE's charge since the BHE's 23-23 vote in December 2022. It also incorporates all feedback from various stakeholders and addresses two key components. The first component is the need to invest in our students by increasing funding and programs to attract students from traditional and non-traditional college pathways, making college more affordable. The second component is the need to invest in our institutions by expanding support services to ensure our students finish their education and succeed in the workforce.

Commissioner Ortega stated that the memorandum also includes the following:

- Provisions for collaboration among our institutional partners;
- Addressing cost drivers; and
- Increases in the SUCCESS program and Early College.

Commissioner Ortega concluded his remarks by emphasizing the memorandum's relationship to the DHE's charge issued by the BHE. C

Chair Gabrieli opened the floor for comments. Member Paul Mattera stated that the upcoming vote is historic, and he is proud to support the proposed increased funding in the budget. Member Bill Walczak expressed gratitude to the BHE and DHE on behalf of the Community Colleges for their efforts in developing the budget, particularly the SUCCESS line item and acknowledgement of MassReconnect. Hearing no further comments, Chair Gabrieli turned to Chief of Staff Elena Quiroz-Livanis to begin the roll call. from the board.

On a motion duly made and seconded, the motion was approved unanimously by all Board members present, through roll call vote, as follows:

- Ann Christenson – Yes
- Veronica Conforme – Yes
- Alex Cortez – Yes
- Patty Eppinger – Yes
- Chair Chris Gabrieli – Yes
- Travis Lawrence – Yes
- Paul Mattera – Yes
- Judy Pagliuca – Yes
- Paul Toner – Yes
- Patrick Tutwiler, Secretary of Education – Abstain
- Bill Walczak – Yes

**BHE-23-30                    APPROVAL OF THE BOARD OF HIGHER EDUCATION FISCAL YEAR 2024  
BUDGET RECOMMENDATIONS**

**VOTED**

The Board of Higher Education hereby approves the attached Board of Higher Education budget priorities and recommendations for Fiscal Year 2024 (Attachment A), and further authorizes the Commissioner to submit the Board's budget priorities and recommendations to the Secretary of Education, in accordance with M.G.L. c. 15A, section 15B. The Board further authorizes and directs the Commissioner to continue to work with the Secretary, Governor, and Legislature to finalize an FY2024 state budget for the Department and the public higher education system that supports the Board's collective priorities for the upcoming academic year.

Authority                    Massachusetts General Laws Chapter 15A, Sections 6, 9 and 15B.

Contact:                    Joe Wallerstein, Interim Deputy Commissioner for Administration and Finance

**IX. PRESENTATION**

List of Documents Used

[Update on Performance Measurement & Accountability](#)

Chair Gabrieli invited Commissioner Ortega to introduce the final agenda item, a presentation from Mario Delci, Associate Commissioner for Research & Planning, the Performance Measurement & Accountability. But first, Chair Gabrieli noted that performance measurement was raised during the framework vote in December 2022 within the context of seeking to ensure that investments are accompanied by performance attention and accountability for the outcomes and impacts on students. He stated that he and Commissioner Ortega agreed to begin discussing the baseline PMRS in calendar year 2023, and today's update will provide more information on where we stand. Chair Gabrieli added that there would be opportunities for further discussion through the Evidence-Based Policy Making (EBPM) Advisory Council during the spring. Chair Gabrieli announced that he would step down as the EBPM Advisory Council chair, and Member Cortez will take his place. Chair Gabrieli added that Board would review the advisory council structure, including membership and charges, during their retreat.

Commissioner Ortega introduced the presentation. He commented on the outstanding work done by Associate Commissioner Delci's team and invited Associate Commissioner Delci to begin his presentation. Associate Commissioner Delci provided an overview of the Performance Measurement Reporting System (PMRS) used by the DHE. Originally launched in 2003, the PMRS is based on key performance indicators for Community Colleges and State Universities. It is updated annually by campus-level reports and embedded in other DHE analytics.

Associate Commissioner Delci stated that over the past eight months, the BHE had approved three major initiatives centered on extensive data analysis and reporting, all requiring careful attention to institutional and student outcomes. The three initiatives include:

- The Strategic Plan for Racial Equity
- The Strategic Plan for Higher Education Finance
- Strategic Framework for Support Services for Student Success

The launch of the Equity Agenda and subsequent BHE vote in 2018 mandated a new set of metrics resulting in the current Tableau-based PMRS tool launched in 2019.

Associate Commissioner Delci continued his presentation by outlining the metrics created for four key areas:

- Access and Affordability
- Student Success and Completion
- Workforce Alignment and Development
- Fiscal Stewardship.

Each metric serves a specific purpose, with some able to separate people based on race and ethnicity.

Unfortunately, the pandemic and turnover have impacted workforce development and fiscal stewardship. Associate Commissioner Delci discussed how the system will incorporate workforce development by the end of FY23. Work on fiscal stewardship will continue as the DHE hires more employees for their Accounting and Finance Department.

Associate Commissioner Delci demonstrated the landing page of the PMRS website and reviewed the steps for retrieving reports from the Commonwealth's public institutions. He emphasized the Equity Lens, Data in Action, and Dive Deeper as report components, with each section containing primary data to provide the information required.

Associate Commissioner Delci then displayed how the PMRS is used as a foundational metric in various areas, including Presidential Evaluations, Campus Strategic Plans, Early College, the Strategic Plan for Racial Equity, Strategic Public Higher Education Financing, and Campus Accreditation Reports. He stated that the DHE has been progressing in developing tableau dashboards over the last few years with an internal focus due to the Higher Education Innovation Fund and State Capital Funds to support data analytics.

Associate Commissioner Delci then displayed the PMRS for Employment and Earnings Outcome Measures. He stated that the BHE had approved three different earnings-related metrics. He noted, however, that much work still needs to be done because it can be challenging to interpret and present earnings before and after student enrollment, earnings of students who enroll after high school, and enrollment in high-value and non-credit workforce development in a meaningful manner.

Associate Commissioner Delci then displayed the PMRS for the DHE's Data Governance Structure launched in January 2022. The components include:

- A steering committee to set data priorities.
- A data council to coordinate and advise on data issues and strategy.
- Working groups to address specific problems.

Associate Commissioner Delci stated that the DHE hopes to bring at least two design metrics online by the end of the calendar year by leveraging the data governance structure. However, we are unlikely to address high-volume, non-credit workforce development. He highlighted Massachusetts' partnership with the US Census and their Public Post-Secondary Employment Outcomes Project. The partnership provides online access to aggregate earnings of graduates from Massachusetts public institutions by degree and area of study. Associate Commissioner Delci concluded his presentation by discussing PMRS and its use for the Strategic Plan for Racial Equity, noting that SPRE applies to UMass, Community Colleges, and State Universities. He stated that there would be continuing discussions with the EBPM advisory council this year to align PMRS and SPRE metrics. He then returned the meeting to Chair Gabrieli.

Chair Gabrieli asked the Board for comments. Commissioner Ortega stated that achieving agreement and consensus among various groups at the federal level presents numerous challenges. The fact that Massachusetts was able to partner with the U.S. Census on metrics that allow everyone to understand



the various efforts made at the institutions is a starting point for the DHE's more extensive project. It starts to answer some of the questions people ask and holds the system accountable for outcomes. The DHE has identified areas where capacity must be built. One is that displaying data solely through dashboards could be more effective if expanded to reach other areas, such as our stakeholders, including members of the legislature who make decisions about higher education investments. We must find ways to incorporate data into our communications among our workforce, industry partners, educational institutions, and anyone who would benefit from knowing how far our institutional partners have progressed.

. Board Member Pagliuca (nquired as to whether the DHE had ever surveyed students and faculty as part of a data set. Associate Commissioner Delci responded that the Data Council's work on a sense of belonging includes system-wide student surveys. They are investigating how to leverage their discoveries. Chief of Staff Quiroz-Livanis responded that the Department launched the first-ever systemwide survey during development of the Strategic Plan for Racial Equity. Chief Legal Counsel Papanikolaou added that the state now requires faculty and staff campus climate surveys at least every four years from all institutions located in the Commonwealth and authorized to grant degrees, including all public and all private higher education institutions. .

## **X. OTHER BUSINESS**

None.

## **XI. ADJOURNMENT**

Chair Gabrieli adjourned the meeting at 12:17 p.m.

*Respectfully Submitted,  
Noe Ortega, Ph.D.  
Commissioner and Secretary to the Board*